

Rabbi Shiah T. Director
25 Chalet Vim Road
Woodbourne, N Y 12788
3 Elul 5761
With the grace of the Almighty

PUBLICIZED LETTER AGAINST ERUVIN

Let it be known forthright. Rabbonim who approved of the eruv in Boro Park studied all information available to them on this subject. Including all published works of Reb Moshe Feinstein, of blessed memory, on this subject.

They know more about eruvim than those who never learned this subject: and, ruled on the matter from posters they saw in the street. Or, from advertisements in newspapers. Or, from what this one or that one told them.

When the eruv in Boro Park was established, a letter from Agudas Harabbonim, supposedly signed by Reb Mose Feinstein, against establishing eruvim, was in the street every week. This letter was also published in newspapers.

Many thought, this was the word of the Almighty, talking to them via the holy sage, of blessed memory, from the past generation. They thought, obviously, those who established the Boro Park eruv, made a mistake: and, ruled against GOD and HIS Torah.

Holy sages who established this eruv were ridiculed. Many who used the eruv were harassed. If they were not harassed, dunned, and beleaguered, they were looked upon as sinners.

Let me tell you a little story about this widely publicized letter. Unknown to the general public.

When this letter, against eruvim, was first publicized twenty years ago. I asked someone to call the Agudas Harabbonim from my house and ask them a question. I did not want to call them. Because, they might recognize my voice.

The caller asked them. How could they issue a letter stating: one who uses an eruv in Brooklyn is desecrating Shabbos, **when the Shulchan Aurach rules he is not desecrating Shabbos?** Because, the Shulchan Aurach rules, 600,000 people must travel on one street, on one day, in order for this street to be classified as a public domain. This required condition does not exist on any street in Brooklyn. Therefore, one can establish an eruv there.

This is a very simple question. An obvious question to anyone learning this subject.

(For the benefit of those not acquainted with the afore mentioned terms. We are adding this short note.

We rule that an eruv cannot be established in a public domain. It can only be established in an area that is a private domain according to the Torah. This required condition, that 600,000 people must travel on one street, on one day, is derived from what our forefathers did in the desert, when they went out of Egypt. They all traveled on one street every day:and, they numbered 600,000. All laws of Shabbos are derived from what they did then. This is explained in detail in Mesecta Shabbos.)

Person in Agudas Harabbonim office answered. He cannot answer this question. Caller was told to call back on Friday. Then someone will be there to answer his question.

When he called on Friday, and asked this question, the person in the

Agudas Harabbonim office asked him if he saw Reb Moshe's tshuvah. He answered yes. Nevertheless, he said, I am still asking my question.

This person from the Agudas Harabbonim then answered him. "Do you think 500 members of Agudas Harabbonim don't know what it says in the Shulchan Aurach"? The caller replied: "You still did not answer my question". Person from the Agudas Harabbonim just repeated what he said. "Do you think 500 members of Agudas Harabbonim don't know what it says in the Shulchan Aurach"? Caller answered: "You still did not answer my question". For a third time person from Agudas Harabbonim answered the same thing.

Let the public know straightforward. The Agudas Harabbonim could not answer a simple question about the letter they publicized: and, they lied. Because, there was never a meeting of 500 members of Agudas Harabbonim to discuss this matter. Even if there was a meeting of all the members of the Agudas Harabbonim. They can not rule against the Shulchan Aurach. This letter was issued without the consent of members of the Agudas Harabbonim: and, was never signed by Reb Moshe Feinstein. It's a fraud, a sham, and a hoax. Publicized with the sole intention of fooling, bamboozling, and hoodwinking the public. Issued by irresponsible people against the eruv.

They know the public is lethargic and torpid. They will easily fall for their hoax.. Woe! They were right. They succeeded in poisoning the minds of thousands for twenty years.

Few questioned this letter from Agudas Harabbonim. They took it at face value.

It is time this nonsense stopped. Holy Jewish people must maintain their self respect, ask questions, and come to their senses.

MORE LIES

Am Ha'Torah, a Torah Journal, published by Agudas Yisroel, printed a letter from Reb Moshe Feinstein, of blessed memory, written to a blind woman from BORO PARK, who asked him if she can go outside with a cane Shabbos (Am Ha'Torah volume 11, 5744). After a detailed discussion, he answered: according to Torah law, a reshus ha'rabim (public domain), does not exist in our times. Therefore, he permitted her to use a cane Shabbos. Even, though, there was no eruv.

Reb Moshe unequivocally ruled, there is no reshus ha'rabim in Brooklyn. If Brooklyn is not a reshus ha'rabim an eruv can be established there. This letter totally obliterates, twenty years of publicity, by liars, in his name, against eruv in Brooklyn.

This absolutely coincides with what many rabbonim said, in his name, after asking him if an eruv can be established in Brooklyn.

However, when this letter was later published in Igros Moshe(Volume 8, Orach Chiam 19) two words were omitted: Boro Park. Someone did not want the public to know that this letter was written to a woman in Brooklyn.

Part 2

When the Boro Park eruv was established, rabbonim there, published a list of poskim, they relied on, who state eruv can be established in all large cities. Some of those quoted, wrote directly about Manhattan, a city larger than Brooklyn. Others wrote about other large cities. Some of these letters were from noted sages who lived a hundred years ago.

After this list of poskim was publicized, the Yeted Ne'eman, and other Orthodox Jewish newspapers, published an advertisement against establishing an eruv in Boro Park. This advertisement stated that names of rabbonim publicized, approving of eruv in large cities, were mostly fictitious.

I wrote them a letter quoting names of their works, and letter number, where this is stated. Because, publicity from the Boro Park rabbonim, only stated their names: but, not where they wrote this.

A retraction would have been appropriate. The New York Times, or any other reputable newspaper, would print a retraction, if they were shown they made a mistake.

However, this will not happen when those against eruv are involved. Because, they intentionally publicize lies. Knowing, the general public does not have these many works, where statements in favor of eruv are written: and, they will not bother to go and find them in a library, or book store, and verify the truth. Therefore, they intentionally publish lies to fool the public: and, never retract these lies.

Those against eruv, know very well, responsible rabbonim approving of the eruv, will not publicize fictitious names. Nevertheless, they publicized these lies to fool the public.

Sincere individuals would go to rabbonim, who published names of prominent rabbonim, gedolei ha'dor, who approved of eruv in large cities, and ask them where their approval of eruv in large cities is stated. If they had doubts about what was publicized.

However, publishing lies is an old trick by those against the eruv. Twenty years ago, when the Flatbush eruv was established, they continuously published lies against eruvim. When Rabbi Sharfman, Rabbi of the Young Israel of Flatbush, who made the eruv there, saw what they were doing, he didn't answer them. He completely ignored them.

There are other lies in afore mentioned advertisement, and in other advertisements against eruvim, placed in Yeted Ne'eman, too numerous to mention. Nevertheless, we will mention another lie. Stated there is: "a dissident group" have made an eruv. Greatest Torah scholars in our generation, and heads of largest congregations in Brooklyn, are not a "dissident group".

Those who placed this advertisement, and were afraid to print their name with it are a "dissident group" of complete "nut jobs". Those who composed this add are zanies: and, editors of Yeted Ne'eman who printed it are bigger zanies and imbeciles.

How do you print an add referring to leading Torah scholars in our generation, authors of prodigious works on Jewish Law, in such terms. You are completely crazy, cretins, and fools.

Part 3

Recently, those against the eruv published an advertisement in Yeted Ne'eman stating, people using the eruv are like Reform Jews. Because, they don't listen to gedolim, Reb Moshe Feinstein, and others.

They stated two lies. First, Reb Moshe was never against establishing eruvim. This was clearly explained before. Second, if one goes against a ruling of Reb Moshe, because, he wants to follow ruling of the Shulchan Aurach and other eminent Torah scholars, he is not a Reform Jew. Reform Jews don't follow the Shulchan Aurach.

One is not obligated to follow lies, distorting Reb Moshe's views, stating exactly the opposite of what he holds. Publicized by mentally disturbed, vile, degenerate, vicious, corrupt, depraved, perverted, and crooked, individuals. They have a lot of nerve labeling **Orthodox Jews** who follow the Shulchan Aurach, and rulings of noted poskim, greatest in previous generations, and in our generation, Reform Jews. Editors of Yeted Ne'eman, a so called Orthodox Jewish newspaper, are mentally disturbed: and, equally guilty for publishing this vile advertisement.

These vile, wretched, and despicable statements were never retracted. Other lies were also published in Yeted Ne'eman. They call themselves an Orthodox Jewish publication. But, fail to maintain minimal requirements of Orthodox Jews. Orthodox Jews are obligated, by our holy Torah, to tell the truth: and, not publicize lies read by thousands.

They also have an obligation, not to publish slanderous statements, against other Jews, read by thousands. This magnifies thousand fold the prohibition of slandering another Jew.

Campaign against eruvim is an effort to fool, dupe, bamboozle the public, and publish lies. There is not one word of truth publicized by those against the eruv.

However, they have not succeeded in fooling the general public, who listen to great and holy sages in our generation, and those from past generations.

While others wallow in degradation and engulf themselves with falsehood. Majority of our holy people rejoice observing Torah of the Almighty. Guided by holy scholars. May they be blessed.

Every woman who goes in the street Shabbos, with a baby carriage, sanctifies His Holy Name. She is actively fighting the forces of evil. Vile individuals who are ignorant and lie. She is actively fighting heresy.

CONCLUSION

During the past twenty years this writer published over twenty books on the subject of erubin. No one has logically refuted what I wrote.

Sometimes, people who are mentally disturbed: and, have a senseless mental block against erubin, make insulting remarks. They yell like mad men and run away.

They can't make logical statements. Or, hold an intelligent conversation.

Some are a bit more intelligent. Nevertheless, they make stupid remarks: and, choose to remain with their stupidity. They also cannot hold an intelligent conversation with some one versed in the subject of erubin.

Because it is impossible to make logical statements against establishing erubin in Brooklyn. An area surrounded by walls on all sides.

Please read the next chapter carefully.

RABBONIM WHO APPROVED OF THE BORO PARK ERUV

Let it be exclaimed straightforward, in the strongest terms, leading scholars in our generation, well known worldwide for their knowledge of Torah, approved of the eruv in Boro Park. Many of them have published many volumes of monumental, and prodigious, works on Jewish Law. Acclaimed, hailed, and commended, by prominent Torah scholars here and in Eretz Yisroel.

Even, though, those against the eruv ridicule them. It does not take away from their greatness in Torah.

Many leading the war against eruvin are ignorant. Others are outright liars. They publish lies without shame trying to fool the public.

Eminent Torah scholars in our generation, and those who follow their ruling, are not fooled by their lies. Because, these holy eminent scholars, rule on Torah law only after extensive research, of all material available to them. Not from posters in the street, with forged signatures, distributed by degenerate liars, seeking to fool the public.

Writing about an obvious fact everyone can easily verify. Will show the reader the moral quality of many who are leading the war against eruvin. Writing about this is ridiculous, comical, and ludicrous. Nevertheless, it must be done.

Many of those leading the war against eruvin claim there are no walls around Brooklyn. Because, these walls are broken in many places.

They lie: and, their stupidity knows no bounds. Without shame, this was published in a booklet. Stated there was where these walls are broken.

Rabbi Rubin, head of the collel in Rav Tuvyah Goldstein's yeshiva, went around Brooklyn, with this booklet in his hand, to see these broken walls. He found, there were no broken walls, at places stated in this booklet. They do not exist.

Amazing, one publishes lies, easily refuted by investigation. Knowing, the general public will not bother to investigate.

It does not matter to him that many people will laugh at him: and, see he's a liar. Because, many stupid people will believe him.

He knows, the general public do not know laws of eruvin. Therefore, he prints what he wants.

Because, we rule, if most of a wall is standing, it is a wall, according to Jewish Law. The area surrounded by it is a private domain. Broken walls do not change the status of a wall. It is still a wall. One just has to make an eruv where it is broken.

Eruv of Boro Park, surrounding the community, is the eruv for any broken walls around the city. If these walls are broken. However, the fact is, they are not broken. This can easily be checked by anyone who wants to take the time to ride around Brooklyn.

Their stupidity is intensified, and enhanced, by the fact that we rule, ocean and rivers are valid walls. We don't need man made sea walls around Brooklyn for it to be a private domain. Because, ocean and rivers surround Brooklyn on more than three sides. Anyone looking at a map of Brooklyn can see this.

In the year 1908, an eruv was established in Manhattan, approved by leading scholars of the generation, relying on the ruling that ocean and rivers are walls, according to Jewish Law. Eruv Vhotzoah, a book published at that time, explains in great detail, basis according to Jewish Law, for this

ruling. This concept is also explained in other famous works of our holy sages.

One might ask a question. In view of the afore mentioned. Why do we need an eruv around Boro Park? There are walls without breaks, and ocean and rivers, surrounding Brooklyn.

Answer to this question is. **We don't need an eruv there.**

Because, unbroken walls, ocean and rivers, are walls. **We have two walls surrounding Brooklyn.**

CONCLUSION

If one can carry in his house. He can carry in the walled city of Brooklyn. According to the Shulchan Aurach. If someone told you, you cannot carry in your house Shabbos, which is surrounded by four walls, you would think he is crazy. Same is true, if someone says, you cannot carry in the walled city of Brooklyn. "It is not found in any posek that one cannot carry in a walled city" (Nishmas Adam clall 49:2).

Therefore, all opposition to this unnecessary eruv, is senseless. This vicious war is led by the ignorant. Even, though, some parade around in rabbinic garb. They are still ignorant and irresponsible.

Many have a psychological imbalance. They do not want to learn laws of erubin. Because of this psychosis.

They are against erubin because of a mental block. But, not for any logical reason.

May the Almighty have mercy on HIS holy people: and, save them from the abyss of heresy, and lies, publicized.

Those who established the Boro Park eruv, **sanctified HIS HOLY NAME**. They dispelled, and destroyed, lies publicized, to fool the public.

Eternal reward, by the Almighty, is waiting for them. These loyal, and holy sages, guided, and directed our holy people. They saved their generation from sinking into the abyss of heresy.

Truth is the name of the Almighty. HIS signature is truth. Those who lie, and spread lies, fight with the Almighty. May we all be privileged to greet Mosheach in the merit of publicizing the truth.

MORE LIES
UPROOTING BASIS OF OUR HOLY TORAH

In preface to Igros Moshah, the author declares that the purpose of his work is to teach Torah. Therefore, he cites proofs for every ruling he writes: and, asks all Torah scholars, and all moreah horah, to carefully analyze these proofs, and clarify themselves, if they should rule like he does. He begs all who study his work to meticulously check out what he writes: and, evaluate his proofs. Only then can they rule like he does.

This guide to learning Igros Moshe, explained in the preface, is the basis for clearly understanding Torah Law. Anyone not doing this, uproots holy Torah concepts, and values. He is going against an explicit ruling of the author.

Who faithfully guided us. He discreetly, and modestly, directed us, how to study his monumental work.

In Igros Moshe (Yore Deah, part 3, letter 91) he states: many people have asked me if they can publish a book, with only his rulings, in Igros Moshe. I did not give them permission. Because, in our generation, no one can state, or publish rulings on Jewish Law, without explaining the reason, and citing proofs.

Also, it can happen that they did not properly quote what I wrote: and, many things are erroneous: and, there are many things that can cause errors, which is worse.

Also, quoting my rulings is a great problem, for these rulings are given to the general public, who are not Torah scholars: and, they will erroneously compare one ruling to another.

Therefore, I am protesting. In strongest terms that one can protest.

He elaborates on this in part 8, letter number 38, Yore Deah. He states there. He does not clearly grasp the complete Talmud Bavli, and Yerushalmi, nor does he know the works of the reshonim and achronim. He has not even seen many of their works. However, he worked to the best of his ability to clarify and elucidate the law. He could do nothing more than this. This is his obligation according to the Torah. However, he can still make a mistake. Therefor, he asks all who study his work to carefully evaluate what he writes. Also see Yore Deah, part 4, letter 88.

In a letter to "Hagon" Rav Menashe Klein (Ibid. Orach Chaim, 109). He declares: Rabbi Klein is obligated by Torah Law to state his opinion against him, if he feels he made a mistake. This also applies to other Torah scholars as stated in other letters.

There the author of Igros Moshe goes into great detail explaining the obligation one has to dispute his views. When he thinks there is an error.

Controversy is the basis of our Torah. The Almighty rejoices when two Torah scholars argue with each other.

Part 2

This is exactly the opposite of what is stated in posters hanging in the street, and published in newspapers, with forged signatures. Proclaiming, everyone must follow ruling of Reb Moshe Feinstein, of blessed memory, and other rabbonim who signed on this document, concerning establishing erubin in Brooklyn.

WOE THIS IS EVEN TAUGHT IN SOME YESHIVOS!

There are two lies expressed in these posters. One, Reb Moshe, of blessed memory, never issued a ruling against establishing erubin in Brooklyn. He only said he does want to get involved in these projects for reasons stated in his many letters on the subject. More, so, he stated, there is no reshus harabim in our generation, AS AFORE MENTIONED (Igras Moshe volume 8 ibid).

Two, even if he did forbid establishing erubin in Brooklyn, no one has an obligation to listen to him. He clearly proclaimed. One must carefully evaluate what he writes and rule only after checking over, and scrutinizing, his proofs. Because, he is only teaching Torah and not ruling on any matter.

Proclamations, declaring one must listen to ruling of all those who signed on a document against erubin in Brooklyn, is a **joke**. Leading poskim in our generation have no obligation to listen to young high school teachers who signed this document, Nor, to a principal of a girls school in Brooklyn who signed on this document. Nor are they obligated to listen to the Boverver Rabbi, Mosha Bick, and others, who signed on this document. Nor, are they obligated to listen to Reb Moshe Feinstein, who's signature was forged. Because, this forged signature, attests exactly the opposite of what he wrote in afore mentioned places, in Igras Mosha.

Clearly stated there is: one has complete, unquestionable, indubitable, right to dispute his rulings after conscientiously scrutinizing what he writes. These posters are a vicious ploy to fool the ignorant public. Who are lazy, or unable, to learn what Reb Moshe writes.

Therefore, they are bamboozled, duped, and flimflammed, into thinking, they must listen to Reb Moshe's ruling against erubin in Brooklyn. When, factually he never issued such a ruling. Even if such a ruling was issued by him. No Rov, or morah horah, has any obligation to listen to it.

These signatures are the hard work of vile, ignorant, liars. Who want to put the public in a mental strait jacket. They know the public does not learn the work Igras Moshe. So they print what they want in his name.

However, this writer is well versed in the work Igras Moshe. Leading poskim, and many others, know what he says. They cannot be fooled.

Renowned poskim laugh at these signatures. Because they mean nothing. Even a clearly explained ruling, with proofs, published in Igras Moshe, means nothing, until scrutinized, and checked over. More, so, signatures by those not recognized as poskim in the Jewish community, means nothing.

This flood of signatures is an attempt, GOD FORBID, to uproot the Torah. Because, through out the generations, Torah scholars argued with each other. Publicizing, one cannot argue with a Torah scholar, is heresy.

More, so, in our generation, when people in Brooklyn, live in a walled city, there is no reason not to establish an eruv there. Anyone against establishing one is: a zany, half-wit, fool. Ignorant, and not knowledgeable.

May the Almighty have mercy on HIS holy people.

MASS HYSTERIA

We see clearly from afore mentioned quotations from Igros Moshe, one is forbidden, in the strongest terms, to issue a ruling, without scrupulously, conscientiously, and painstakingly, evaluating his proofs. More, so, one is forbidden, in the strongest terms, to publicize his rulings, without doing this.

Torah is not a joke. It's a serious matter. One must earnestly toil in Torah, conscientiously learn all sources available, and then rule on a matter of Jewish Law.

Woe! We are living in a generation, where mass hysteria has enveloped many, in a mental strait jacket. They yell madly, Reb Moshe is godel hador, and posek hador, and, we must listen to him.

However, they rule from posters in the street, and forged letters. No one carefully reads what he writes in Igros Moshe. No one carefully learns what the Shulchan Aurach, and poskim, rule.

Yes! We must listen to him. Learn carefully, scrupulously, conscientiously, and painstakingly, what he wrote in Igros Moshe. As he clearly and unequivocally commanded you to do.

If you are unable to do this. Because of lack of intelligence. Or, are too busy. Keep quiet.

Because, he clearly forbade one to rule on a matter discussed in Igros Moshe, without doing this. You are going against a clear, unequivocal, and unmistakable, ruling from Reb Moshe, if you don't do this.

As stated previously, and in other works (see "LETTERS FROM WOODBOURNE" p.5 & 7) those against eruvin never read what Reb Moshe wrote on this subject. They are against eruvin. Because, this one, or that one, told them what he heard about Reb Moshe's ruling, or they saw posters in the street, against eruvin, with his forged signature.

They think posters can't lie. Woe! For many what a poster in the street, and an advertisement in the newspaper says, is Torah directly from The Almighty.

However, Reb Moshe rules, one cannot attain clarity on a matter of Jewish Law, without understanding the reason for this ruling, and checking out proofs cited. He must learn Igros Moshe, and other poskim, and elucidate Torah Law, before issuing a ruling. More, so, before proclaiming this ruling to others. This is not done by reading posters.

Reb Moshe, of blessed memory, our leader, the greatest sage in the past generation, earnestly wanted our holy people to arduously, and seriously, learn Torah. Not to rule from posters in the street, and a forged letter, from Agudas Harabbonim.

Woe! Few listened to him. Except, holy sages, who established the eruv in Boro Park.

Part 2

This sad state of affairs came about. Because, of chassidisha influence on our community. Chassidim don't have to have a reason for anything. Their

Rebbi's statement, or ruling, is like the word of the Almighty.

The Boverer Rebbi, signed against establishing erubin in Brooklyn two times, once in 5739, and another time in 5741. For over twenty years, he could not produce logical reasons, for his position. Same is true of other Chasidisha Rebbis who signed against erubin. Not one, in twenty years, produced literature explaining their position.

However, Reb Moshe Feinstein was not a Casiddisha Rebbi. He stated clear reasons for his position on any matter. He instructed all to carefully study what he wrote. He told Torah scholars, according to Torah Law, they are obligated to argue with him, when they think he erred.

Something unthinkable by a Rebbi. But, our holy sage, of blessed memory, was not a Rebbi. He was a Litvishe Godel. This was the custom of all Litvishe Gedolim. They were successful in spreading Torah, building yeshivos, and creating Gedolei Torah, following in their footsteps, by these methods.

They published monumental works on Torah. Knowing, in their generation, and future generations, someone might dispute their views. But, they didn't care. Because, the Almighty rejoices when two Torah scholars argue together. Our holy Talmud tells us that the Almighty reviews arguments of our holy sages.

Litvishe yeshiva bochrim, and their roshei yeshiva, have made Reb Moshe a Casiddishe Rebbe. They decreed, one must blindly follow, a prohibition against erubin, they learned about from posters, and a forged letter. They decreed this must be publicized on other posters. They signed on these posters. Without reviewing, and carefully scrutinizing, what Reb Moshe writes on the subject. Against his absolute ruling.

They should have bought him a clored bekesha, with bright flowers: and, invited the Mayor of New York for hakofos Simchas Torah at Yeshiva Teferes Yerushalaim, to watch him dance.

May the Almighty have mercy on HIS holy people.